



March 1995 Meeting Minutes

SRS Citizen's Advisory Board

Savannah, Ga.

Members Present

Members present were Julie Arbogast, Anne Brown, Lenola Cooks, Thomas Costikyan, Brian Costner, Thomas Greene, Alice Hollingsworth, Thelonius Jones, Walter Jones, Bill Lawless, Ann Loadholt, Kathryn May, Mildred McClain, JoAnn Nestor, Lane Parker, Andrew Rea, P.K. Smith, Pat Tousignant and Beaurine Wilkins. Ex-Officio Representatives were Thomas Heenan, Camilla Warren, John Stockwell (Alternate) and Ann Ragan.

Members absent were Myles Grant, Kamalakar Raut and Bob Slay. Jeff Crane of the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), Myra Reece of the South Carolina Department of Health and Environmental Control (SCDHEC) and Steve Richardson of the Department of Energy (DOE) were not in attendance. The DOE Designated Federal Official present was Thomas Heenan.

This meeting was open to the public and posted in the Federal Register in accordance with the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA).

J. Walter Joseph of Aiken, S.C. was introduced as the CAB Facilitator.

Key Decisions Made by Board

Larry McKinney of Richmond Hill, Ga., and Vernon Zinnerman of Augusta, Ga., were elected to fill vacant positions previously held by Harry Jue of Savannah, Ga., and Moses Todd of Augusta, Ga.

The Board adopted a recommendation which provides screening and performance criteria for the evaluation of alternatives considered in the Foreign Research Reactor Environmental Impact Statement.

By majority vote, the Board recommended that DOE initiate an Independent Scientific Peer Review (ISPR) of the F&H and A&M groundwater remediation projects. The recommendation included DOE working with the CAB and its regulators in defining the scope of the ISPR, CAB review of ISPR conclusions and development of Part B Permit changes.

Also by majority vote, the Board provided a recommendation regarding transuranic (TRU) waste. It asks DOE to categorize high-activity transuranic waste as an urgent problem; to expedite the selection of an appropriate organic treatment by year end; to assign the highest priority to obtaining funding no later than FY97 to address TRU waste needs; and to reconsider its repackaging plan carefully, possibly including a ISPR to determine if SRS can wait to repack the waste, without incurring undue risk, until a treatment option is available.

Approval of Minutes

The minutes of the January 24, 1995, CAB meeting were approved with no changes.

Agency Updates

Tom Heenan announced that the Board's second recommendation had been accepted by DOE and copies of the acceptance letter were provided (see attached). He also announced that DOE and the SRS CAB Risk Management and Future Use Subcommittee would co-sponsor a second Future Use Public Workshop on April 11 at the Barnwell County State Park.

Camilla Warren announced she had met with representatives from the Paducah Gaseous Diffusion Plant to initiate development of its Site Specific Advisory Board. She also announced that a pilot project consisting of a series of public meetings would be held in May 1995 in Savannah, Ga., to discuss outreach issues. She stated she was working with DOE-ER Director Cynthia Anderson on a joint summer internship for a college-bound or college student and said this position would be advertised in area communities. Camilla Warren introduced John Stockwell as Jeff Crane's substitute stating he was a regional expert on human health effects.

Ann Ragan reported that the Federal Facility Agreement was still in negotiation. She also stated that an interim report had been released by the Consortium for Environmental Risk Evaluation and that SCDHEC was not supportive of the report. She encouraged Board members to review the report. Ann Ragan also announced that the Resource Conservation and Recovery Act Permit was out for public comment through April 17, 1995, and that SCDHEC was hosting a public meeting April 6 at the Aiken Conference Center.

Membership Replacement Election and Subcommittee Report

Two replacement Board members were elected by silent ballot. Vernon Zinnerman of Augusta, Ga., was elected to fill the vacant position previously held by Moses Todd. Larry McKinney of Richmond Hill, Ga., was elected to fill the vacant position previously held by Harry Jue. The latter election first resulted in a tie vote between Larry McKinney and Paul Feldman of Savannah, Ga.

Membership Replacement Subcommittee Chairperson Beaurine Wilkins presented a letter of resignation from Board member Rachael Harper.

SRS 1997 Budget Priorities/CAB Input

Mildred McClain asked for comments on a second draft letter to Secretary Hazel O'Leary regarding budget reductions at SRS. Brian Costner submitted a modified letter addressed to Assistant Secretary Thomas Grumbly (see attached). Camilla Warren encouraged the Board to copy EPA administrator Steve Herman on the letter. Following discussion, Mildred McClain stated she and Bob Slay would integrate the two letters into one recommendation and distribute it to Board members for final comment prior to mailing it to DOE-Headquarters.

Nuclear Materials Management Subcommittee Report

Nuclear Materials Management Subcommittee Chairperson Tom Costikyan presented two categories of criteria used to evaluate alternatives in the environmental impact statement (EIS) process. He stated the NMM Subcommittee had attempted to rank the importance of the categories of criteria to be used in evaluation of alternatives in the Foreign Research Reactor EIS. He explained that screening criteria are "go" or "no-go" criteria and stated that if an alternative does not meet this minimal criteria, it is discarded. He said the subcommittee had agreed on three Screening (Absolute) Criteria (see attached). He then presented Performance Criteria (see attached), stating that these criteria were used to evaluate alternatives. He said the Subcommittee had assigned degrees of importance to the performance criteria (high, moderate and low) and that they had put together a core list of criteria.

Following discussion regarding ultimate disposition of wastes, transportation and regulatory compliance, Thelonius Jones moved the Board accept the NMM Subcommittee recommendation. Bill Lawless seconded the motion. **Brian Costner moved the Board amend the recommendation by moving the "Complies with regulatory requirements" criterion to the second bullet under performance criteria and deleting all headings (high, moderate and low) under performance criteria. Ann Loadholt seconded this amendment. The amended motion passed with 10 members in favor, seven opposed and one abstention.**

A second amendment was offered by Brian Costner to delete "Expedites ultimate disposition" from performance criteria, yet include it as a strong statement in the text of the transmittal letter. The motion failed with five members in favor, eight opposed and three abstentions.

JoAnn Nestor moved the Board consider a third amendment to add "Regulatory Compliance" to screening criteria. Pat Tousignant seconded. The third amendment passed with a vote of 11 members in favor and seven opposed.

The Board voted to pass the recommendation as amended with 17 members in favor and one abstention.

Environmental Remediation Program Subcommittee Report

Environmental Remediation Program Subcommittee Chair Bill Lawless presented ten motions to be provided by the Subcommittee during the next year (see attached). He then presented background information to support a motion regarding groundwater remediation projects and uncertainties associated with the effectiveness of these projects to achieve significant risk

reduction, ecological and regulatory benefits (see attached). Mr. Lawless discussed the history of the F&H Seepage Basins, the F&H groundwater remediation project status, regulatory considerations, Savannah River water quality and tritium releases and he referred to several sources of information regarding the F&H groundwater remediation project (see attached presentation).

Bill Lawless read the proposed recommendation on groundwater remediation which states that DOE will initiate an Independent Scientific Peer Review (ISPR) of the F&H and A&M groundwater remediation projects (see attached). The recommendation also included DOE's working with the CAB and its regulators in defining the scope of the ISPR, CAB review of the ISPR conclusions and development of Part B Permit changes. Ann Loadholt seconded the motion.

Following extensive discussion regarding the validity of scientific reviews, regulatory compliance, technical assistance, the timeframe of the proposed ISPR and public opinion concerning tritium, **Pat Tousignant moved to amend the motion, stating that the ISPR should be initiated by the Board, not by DOE. The motion failed with a vote of six members in favor, seven opposed and two abstentions.**

Brian Costner moved to strike the reference to cost benefit analysis (CBA) in item number one of the motion. Following discussion with Bill Lawless, a friendly motion to refer to CBA as an e.g. was accepted. Brian Costner also moved that item number six be deleted from the motion. This was accepted as a friendly motion.

The Board voted to pass the original recommendation as amended with a vote of 11 in favor, four opposed and one abstention. (Two Board members were not present for this vote.)

Bill Lawless presented a second motion regarding Pu-238 combustible waste management (see attached). His presentation included a description of transuranic (TRU) waste, its associated hazards, the current SRS inventory of TRU waste and waste treatment options available. **Bill Lawless moved the Board recommend that DOE categorize high activity transuranic waste as an urgent problem; expedite the selection of an appropriate organic treatment by year end; assign the highest priority to obtain funding no later than FY97; and reconsider its repackaging plan carefully, possibly including a review by ISPR to determine if SRS can wait until a treatment option is available without incurring undue risk. Lane Parker seconded the motion.**

Discussion revolved around Waste Isolation Pilot Plant acceptance criteria, transportation issues and the condition of SRS TRU wastes. Brian Costner presented three comments for Board consideration. He stated he was troubled that the motion simply asked DOE to create another panel to study the situation without providing more specific direction. He referred to CAB technical assistance funding, noting it was available should the Board choose to initiate its own studies. His second comment was that thoughtful consideration should be given to national treatment plans and potential impacts of out-of-state waste being shipped to SRS. His third

comment was that calling for a study could potentially impact money allocated for on-going repackaging or future construction of a treatment facility.

The motion passed with ten Board members in favor and seven abstentions. Bill Lawless asked that Brian Costner's comments be addressed by DOE.

Administrative Items

Nominations/Elections Subcommittee Chair Ann Loadholt requested that JoAnn Nestor be appointed as Interim Chairperson of the Bylaws Subcommittee. All members present were in favor.

Brian Costner stated the Board needed to discuss the issue of outreach and possibly produce a short newsletter stating what the Board has accomplished. He also presented a proposal from Carol Tuynman of the League of Women Voters of Northern Beaufort County asking for Board support in producing a series of public forums (see attached). He also questioned the Board's process for pursuing the use of technical assistance funding and asked for a description of Walt Joseph's role as facilitator.

Tom Greene stated he would like to see a community outreach subcommittee formed, noting that \$44,000 has been earmarked for this activity. Mildred McClain stated a committee had been formed to develop a draft brochure, which would be available for Board review in the near future.

Public Comments

Seven citizens attended a public meeting held Monday, March 27, 1995, at 6 p.m. Clarifying questions were asked regarding membership and subcommittee work. The following comments were provided:

George Minot, Hilton Head Island, S.C. Resident

Mr. Minot presented written questions generated following the publishing of two news articles (see attached). A written response has been provided, but the following responses were provided at the meeting, as well.

Q. What would be the purpose in constructing a new reactor complex at SRS, other than creating jobs?

A. DOE terminated plans for a new tritium production reactor in September 1992. Plans for a multi-purpose reactor were brought to DOE by a private consortium. A reactor is one of the technologies being evaluated as a new tritium source. The Secretary of Energy will make a decision in November regarding a new tritium source and its location.

Q. What was the sense of urgency in restarting the F-Canyon line? Is there a clear and present danger associated with this particular 80,000 gallons of solutions?

A. There was a technical review and environmental assessment conducted prior to restarting the F-Canyon. No new material is being processed. Only the liquid materials which are currently in the canyon are being processed to put them in a more stable form. These materials could pose a safety hazard to employees in the facility.

Mr. Minot stated he had not received written responses to his concerns in the past. Mildred McClain committed to a written response. Mr. Minot stated he was concerned about the safety of operating F Canyon.

Helen Blum, Savannah, Ga., resident

Ms. Helen Blum stated concern over safety in light of Westinghouse layoffs. She questioned why so many employees were being released. Jim Guisti of DOE Office of External Affairs stated that budget reductions would require the workforce reductions of 4000 individuals by fiscal year 1996 and FY97 may require 2000 to 4000 more reductions. He stated, however, that prior to startup of any facility, an operational readiness review is required. Brian Costner added that readiness reviews include various procedures and requirements for the number of employees necessary to operate a facility. He stated that even in the face of cutbacks, facilities must be appropriately staffed.

The following public comments were received on March 28, 1995, at 3:30 p.m.:

Quasima Boston, Citizens for Environmental Justice, Savannah, Ga.

Ms. Quasima Boston stated she was disappointed by the groundwater remediation recommendation and thought that the Board would be more sensitive to people affected by such decisions. She emphasized her disappointment.

Sentioali Boston, Savannah, Ga. resident

Mr. Boston stated that pump and treat techniques could remove tritium from groundwater before it reached the Savannah River and that this was very important to the citizens of Savannah. He said he too was disappointed in the Board. He stated the Board should seek more public input and listen to public comments.

Halimah Rashied, Savannah, Ga. resident

Ms. Rashied stated she did not understand the groundwater motion just passed by the Board. She stated it appeared the Board was telling her it would rather drink and bathe in dirty water. She stated she needed to understand.

Carol Tuynman, Best Chance Network -- Cancer Institute, Beaufort, S.C.

Ms. Carol Tuynman questioned contracts at SRS to start another nuclear reactor. She stated no more reactor activity should be considered until agencies have solutions to chemical degradation.

She stated there is a lot of cancer in the area and that people are afraid to admit it. She asked how the government can say it is protecting people when it is perpetuating a war machine.

Handouts

- Nuclear Materials Management presentation slides, Tom Costikyan
- ER & WM Subcommittee Motions, Bill Lawless
- F&H Groundwater Motion presentation slides, Bill Lawless
- SRS CAB Environmental Remediation & Waste Management Subcommittee Program Motion on Groundwater Remediation
- SRS CAB Environmental Remediation & Waste Management Program Subcommittee Motion on Pu238 Combustible Waste Management
- Transuranic Waste presentation slides, Bill Lawless
- Draft Vision Future Land Use - Savannah River Site with map of draft industrial zones, Brian Costner
- Calendar of Public Involvement Events
- EIS Citizens Advisory Board Monthly Report
- Letter, DOE to SRS CAB, dated March 24, 1995, subject: Industrial and Residential Use Alternatives for Cleanup Decisions at the Savannah River Site
- Letter, EPA/SCDHEC to SRS CAB dated March 23, 1995.
- Draft Letter, SRS CAB to Thomas Grumbly
- Proposal to SRS CAB from Carol Tuynman, President, League of Women Voters of Northern Beaufort County, dated March 23, 1995
- Questions submitted by George Minot of Hilton Head Island, S.C.